

Coram: Allie et Baartman JJ

Date of hearing: Monday, 15 June 2020



CASE NO: 5807/2020

In the matter between:

DUWAYNE ESAU	First Applicant
NEO MKWANE	Second Applicant
TAMI JACKSON	Third Applicant
LINDO KHUZWAYO	Fourth Applicant
MIKHAIL MANUEL	Fifth Applicant
RIAAN SALIE	Sixth Applicant
SCOTT ROBERTS	Seventh Applicant
MPIYAKHE DLAMINI	Eighth Applicant
and	
THE MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS	First Respondent
THE PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA	Second Respondent
THE MINISTER OF TRADE, INDUSTRY AND COMPETITION	Third Respondent

**THE PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF
SOUTH AFRICA IN HIS CAPACITY AS THE
CO-CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL
CORONAVIRUS COMMAND COUNCIL**

Fourth Respondent

**THE MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE
AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS IN HER CAPACITY
AS THE CO-CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL
CORONAVIRUS COMMAND COUNCIL**

Fifth Respondent

THE NATIONAL CORONAVIRUS COMMAND COUNCIL

Sixth Respondent

**THE GOVERNMENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF
SOUTH AFRICA**

Seventh Respondent

**THE NATIONAL DISASTER MANAGEMENT
CENTRE**

Eighth Respondent

INDEX

No.	Pleadings	Page No
1.	Notice of Motion dated 20 May 2020	1 – 7
2.	Founding Affidavit deposed to by the First Applicant, Duwayne Esau dated 20 March 2020	8 – 59
	2.1 Annexure “FA1” – Government Notice: Classification of a National Disaster dated 15 March 2020	60
	2.2 Annexure “FA2” – Government Notice: Declaration of a National State of Disaster dated 15 March 2020	61
	2.3 Annexure “FA3” – Covid-19: Presentation to Cabinet dated 20 April 2020	62 – 107

2.4 Annexure “ FA4 ” – President Cyril Ramaphosa: South Africa's Response to Coronavirus COVID-19 pandemic dated 23 April 2020	108 – 116
2.5 Annexure “ FA5 ” – Schedule of Services: Framework for Sectors dated 25 April 2020	117 – 138
2.6 Annexure “ FA6 ” – Government Gazette: Regulations issued in terms of S27(2) of the Disaster Management Act, 2002 dated 29 April 2020	139 – 177
2.7 Annexure “ FA7 ” – Government Notice: Directions regarding the Sale of Clothing, Footwear and Bedding during Alert Level 4 of the Covid-19 National State of Disaster dated 12 May 2020	178 – 183
2.8 Annexure “ FA8 ” – President Cyril Ramaphosa: South Africa's Response to Coronavirus COVID-19 pandemic dated 13 May 2020	184 – 198
2.9 Annexure “ FA9 ” – Fiscal Implication of Covid-19 & intervention by government to stimulate the economy: National Treasury briefing; with Minister and Deputy dated 30 April 2020	199 – 203
2.10 Annexure “ FA10 ” – Letter to Cyril Xaba from Cyril Ramaphosa re: Employment of Additional members of the SANDF in cooperation with the SAPS dated 21 April 2020	204

2.11 Annexure "FA11" – Letter to RHK Attorneys from R.Cassius Lubisi re: Concerns about the Constitutional and Statutory Authority of the National Coronavirus Command Council	205 – 207
3. Confirmatory Affidavit deposed to by the Second Applicant, Neo Mkwane dated 20 May 2020	208 - 210
4. Confirmatory Affidavit deposed to by the Third Applicant, Tami Jackson dated 20 May 2020	211 – 213
5. Confirmatory Affidavit deposed to by the Fourth Applicant, Lindo Khuzwayo dated 20 May 2020	214 – 216
6. Confirmatory Affidavit deposed to by the Fifth Applicant, Mikhail Manuel dated 20 May 2020	217 – 219
7. Confirmatory Affidavit deposed to by the Sixth Respondent, Riaan Salie dated 20 May 2020	220 – 222
8. Confirmatory and Supporting Affidavit deposed to by Seventh Respondent, Scott Haigh Roberts dated 20 May 2020	223 – 231
8.1 Annexure "SR1" – Financial Mail Article written by Rob Rose: <i>Mkhize, moaning of 'unfair criticism, fails to see how this ends</i> dated 18 May 2020	232 – 236
8.2 Annexure "SR2" – Article written by Barbara Friedman: <i>Glenda Gray clarifies her comments about lockdown</i> dated	

18 May 2020	237 – 240
9. Confirmatory and Supporting Affidavit deposed to by Eighth Respondent Mpiyakhe Dlamini dated 20 May 2020	241 – 263
9.1 Annexure “SA1” – President Cyril Ramaphosa: Measures to combat Coronavirus Covid-19 epidemic dated 15 March 2020	264 – 268
9.2 Annexure “SA2” – Tweet from Twitter account dated March 2020	269
9.3 Annexure “SA3” – Statement by President Cyril Ramaphosa on escalation of measures to combat the Covid-19 epidemic, Union Buildings, Tshwane dated 24 March 2020	270 – 277
9.4 Annexure “SA4” – Message by President Cyril Ramaphosa on Covid-19 pandemic dated 09 April 2020	278 – 286
9.5 Annexure “SA5” – Business day Article: <i>Is the government’s Covid-19 response undermining the Constitution</i> dated 16 April 2020	287 – 289
9.6 Annexure “SA6” – Risk-adjusted strategy for Economic Activity	290 – 317
9.7 Annexure “SA7” – Statement by President Cyril Ramaphosa on South Africa’s Response to the Coronavirus pandemic, Union Buildings, Tshwane dated 23 April 2020	318 – 325
9.8 Annexure “SA8” – Letter from RHK Attorneys to the Presidency re: Concerns about the Constitutional and Statutory Authority of the National Coronavirus Command Council dated 27 April 2020	326 – 334

9.9 Annexure “SA9” – Letter from R. Cassius Lubisi to RHK Attorneys re: Concerns about the Constitutional and Statutory Authority of the National Coronavirus Command Council dated 04 May 2020	335 – 337
9.10 Annexure “SA10” – Address by the President: “From the desk of the President” dated 04 May 2020	338 – 341
9.11 Annexure “SA11” – Letter to the Presidency from re: Concerns about the Constitutional and Statutory Authority of the NCCC dated 8 May 2020	342 – 348
10. Rule 16A Notice dated 20 May 2020	349 – 355
11. Notice of Opposition dated 25 May 2020	356 – 358
12. Filing Notice: First Respondent’s Answering Affidavit dated 05 May 2020	359 – 362
13. Answering Affidavit deposed to by the First Respondent, Nkosazana Clarice Dlamini-Zuma dated 05 June 2020	363 – 465
13.1 Annexure “NZ1” - Government Notice: Regulations issued in terms of Section 21(2) of the Disaster Management Act, 2002 dated 17 March 2020	466 – 487
13.2 Annexure “NZ2” - Covid-19 Pandemic Lockdowns: Lockdown data as of 04 June 2020	488 – 497
13.3 Annexure “NZ3” - Government Gazette: Disaster Management Act, 2002: Amendment of Regulations issued in terms of Section 27(2) dated 25 March 2020	498 – 513

13.4 Annexure “NZ4” - Government Notice: Disaster Management Act, 2002: Amendment of Regulations issued in terms of Section 27(2) dated 26 March 2020	514 - 516
13.5 Annexure “NZ5” - Government Notice: Disaster Management Act, 2002: Amendment of Regulations issued in terms of Section 27(2) dated 01 April 2020	517 - 531
13.6 Annexure “NZ6” - Government Notice: Disaster Management Act, 2002: Amendment of Regulations issued in terms of Section 27(2) dated 16 April 2020	532 – 582
13.7 Annexure “NZ7” - Government Notice: Disaster Management Act, 2002: Amendment of Regulations issued in terms of Section 27(2) dated 19 April 2020	583
13.8 Annexure “NZ8” - Economic Cluster – undated	584
13.9 Annexure “NZ9” - Covid-19 Risk-adjusted approach dated 25 April 2020	585 – 595
13.10 Annexure “NZ10” - Request for Comments: Schedule of Services to be phased in as per the COVID-19 Risk-adjusted Strategy dated 25 April 2020	596 - 597
13.11 Annexure “NZ11” - Guidelines on the Submission of Comments – undated	598 – 599
13.12 Annexure “NZ12” - Report on issues raised by Sectors and the Public dated 28 April 2020	600 – 624

13.13 Annexure “ NZ13 ” - Government Notice: Disaster Management Act, 2002: Amendment of Regulations issued in terms of Section 27(2) dated 28 May 2020	625 – 643
13.14 Annexure “ NZ14 ” – Letter from Cyril Ramaphosa re: Appointment to the National Command Council for Combatting Covid-19 dated 18 March 2020	644
13.15 Annexure “ NZ15 ” – Email Correspondence from Emil Scharf to Registrar Leana Tolken dated 04 June 2020	645
13.16 Annexure “ NZ16 ” – Letter from Emil Scharf to the Honourable Judge Allie and Judge Baartman dated 06 June 2020	646 – 657
13.17 Annexure “ NZ17 ” – Notice that the First, Second, Third, Fourth and Fifth Respondents seeking Condonation for late filing of papers dated 05 June 2020	658 – 660
13.18 Annexure “ NZ18 ” – Comprehensive Interview Schedule on Covid-19: undated	661 – 689
13.19 Annexure “ NZ19 ” – Schedule of Media Ministerial Media Briefing on the Coronavirus 16 March 2020 to 29 May 2020	690 – 697
14. Filing Notice: Supporting Affidavit of Mmapaka Ephraimtau re: First Respondent’s Answering Affidavit dated 05 June 2020	698 – 701
15. Supporting Affidavit deposed to by Mmaphaka Tau dated 05 June 2020	702 – 708

16. Filing Notice: Confirmatory Affidavit of Cassius Reginald Lubisi re: First Respondent's Answering Affidavit dated 05 June 2020	709 – 712
17. Confirmatory Affidavit deposed to by Cassius Reginald Lubisi dated 05 June 2020	713 – 715
18. Expert Affidavit deposed to by Salim Safurdeen Abdool Karim dated 05 June 2020	716 – 728
18.1 Annexure “SSK2” - SA Covid-19 Epidemic trends dated 29 May 2020	729 – 742
18.2 Annexure “SSK1” – Curriculum Vitae: Salim Safurdeen Abdool Karim dated 14 April 2020	743 – 804
19. Filing Notice: Confirmatory Affidavit of Cassius Reginald Lubisi re: First Respondent's Answering Affidavit dated 05 June 2020	805 - 808*
20. Confirmatory Affidavit deposed to by Cassius Reginald Lubisi dated 05 June 2020	809 – 811*
21. Answering Affidavit deposed to by the Third Respondent, Ebrahim Patel dated 05 June 2020	812 – 851
21.1 Annexure “EP1a” – Letter to Minister Patel from Michael J Lawrence re: Clarification on Product Range dated 30 April 2020	852
21.2 Annexure “EP1b” - Addendum: Permitted Sale List – undated	853 – 854
21.3 Annexure “EP2” - Email Correspondence from Mahendra Shunmoogam re: CTFL Sector: Action Items and Next steps:	

meeting with Min Patel: 04 May 2020 dated 05 May 2020	855 – 857
21.4 Annexure “EP3” - Media Release: Clothing, Textile, Footwear and Leather Industry consultative meeting with Minister Ebrahim Patel dated 05 May 2020	858 - 862
21.5 Annexure “EP4a” – Email correspondence re: CTFL Sector Framework Back2Work Protocol and List of Winter Items dated 06 May 2020	863 – 864
21.6 Annexure “EP5a” – Email correspondence to Mahendra Shunmoogam from Paul Theron dated 05 May 2020	865
21.7 Annexure “EP5b” – Email correspondence to Mahendra Shunmoogam from Mark Blair re: CTFL Sector Framework Back2Work Protocol and List of Winter Items dated 07 May 2020	866 – 868
21.8 Annexure “EP5c” – Permitted Sale List: Winter Clothing Level 4 – undated	869
21.9 Annexure “EP5d” – Email correspondence to Mahendra Shunmoogam from Ashley Benjamin of National Union of Leather and Allied Workers re: CTFL Sector Framework Back2Work Protocol and List of Winter Items dated 07 May 2020	870 – 872
21.10 Annexure “5f” – Email correspondence from Marthie Raphael to Mahendra Shunmoogam re: CTFL Sector Framework Back2Work Protocol and List of Winter items: for review, edit,	

comment dated 07 May 2020	873
21.11 Annexure “5g” – Email correspondence from Etienne Vlok to Mahendra Shunmoogam re: CTFL Sector Framework Back2Work Protocol and List of Winter items: for review, edit, comment dated 07 May 2020	874
21.12 Annexure “5h” – Winter footwear, leather good, general goods and luggage categories and descriptions that will be allowed to be manufactured against confirmed orders or forecasts from retailers for the Winter 2020 season - undated	875 – 876
21.13 Annexure “5j” – Email correspondence from Phumlani Dyini to Mahendra Shunmoogam re: CTFL Sector Framework Back2Work Protocol and List of Winter items: for review, edit, comment dated 07 May 2020	877
21.10 Annexure “EP6” – Letter via email to Ebrahim Patel from Paul Coetser of Werksmans Incorporated re: Possible Business Anti-Competitive Impact of the Proposed Exemption of Essential Services Businesses which will remain open during “Lockdown” period dated 25 March 2020	878 – 880
22. Filing Notice: Replying Affidavit deposed to by the First Applicant, Duwayne Esau dated 08 June 2020	881 – 883
23. Replying Affidavit deposed to by the First Applicant, Duwayne Esau dated 08 June 2020	884 – 931
23.1 Annexure “RA1” – Proclamation no. R61 of 2016:	

Establishment of the Intergovernmental Committee of the Disaster Management Act, 2002 (Act no.57 of 2002) dated 18 August 2016	932 – 934
23.2 Annexure “ RA2 ” – Statement by President Cyril Ramaphosa on call for a Day of Prayer on coronavirus - undated	935 – 938
24. Filing Notice: Replying Affidavit deposited to by the Eighth Applicant, Mpiyakhe Dlamini dated 09 June 2020	939 – 941
25. Replying Affidavit deposited to by the Eighth Applicant, Mpiyakhe Dlamini dated 09 June 2020	942 – 964
25.1 Annexure “ RSA1 ” – Court Order dated 29 May 2020	965 – 967
25.2 Annexure “ RSA2 ” – NDZ Contradictions Table – undated	968 – 970
25.3 Annexure “ RSA3 ” – Article: <i>SA’s Covid-19 models were ‘flawed’, says former NICD expert</i> dated 24 April 2020	971 – 974
25.4 Annexure “ RSA3.1 ” – National Assembly, Questions for written Reply dated 1 May 2020	975 – 976
25.5 Annexure “ RSA4 ” – Filing Notice: Respondents Answering Affidavit in the case of <i>De Beer // The Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs</i> , dated 26 May 2020	977 – 1019
26. Proof of service of the First Applicant’s Replying Affidavit via email on the State Attorney, Emil Scharf	1020
27. Proof of service of the Eighth Applicant’s Replying Affidavit via email on the State Attorney, Emil Scharf	1021

Note: *There is a Page 143 and a Page 143A in the Founding Affidavit

*Page 315 is a Blank page in the Founding Affidavit

*Duplicate of: 1. Filing Notice: Confirmatory Affidavit of Cassius Reginald Lubisi
2. Confirmatory Affidavit deposed to by Cassius Reginald Lubisi
(Pages 805 – 811)

DATED at CAPE TOWN on this 11th day of **JUNE 2020**.

ADRIAANS ATTORNEYS

Per: 

A ADRIAANS

Applicants Attorneys

16th Floor, 2 Long Street

CAPE TOWN

(Ref: AA/dd/R193)

dominique.dirks@adriaansattorneys.com

TO: THE REGISTRAR
Western Cape High Court
35 Keerom Street
CAPE TOWN

AND TO: STATE ATTORNEY
Attorney for Respondents 1 – 8 Respondents
4th Floor, Liberty Centre
22 Long Street
CAPE TOWN
(Ref: 747/20/P29)
EScharf@justice.gov.za